



**Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited**

(A Govt. of India Enterprise)

Recruitment Section, BSNL CO

Eastern Court Building, Janpath, New Delhi -110001

Letter No.- BSNLCO-COMN/12(19)/30/2023-RECTT-CO

Dated 10/11/2023

To

**Shri P Abhimanyu  
General Secretary  
BSNL EU, New Delhi.**

**Sub : Review of result of failed SC/ST Candidates – Case of Shri L Mothilal, Lorry Driver  
Telangana Telecom Circle for the LICE of JE (T) held on 18.12.2022.**

Sir,

I am directed to refer to your letter No. BSNLEU/519 (SC/ST) dated 16.10.02023 vide which, inter- alia, it was requested to take necessary action for reviewing the result of Shri L Mothilal, Motor Driver, by applying lesser standards of evaluation. The case has been examined/considered as per details below:-

2. The LICE for JE (T) for VY 2020 was notified on 08.07.2022 with single paper as per following details tabulated below:

S. No.	Section	Subject	Maximum Marks/ No. of Questions
1.	Part I	Electrical, Electronics & Communication	50 Marks/ 50 Questions
2.	Part II	Departmental Practice	50 Marks/ 50 Questions

(i) The minimum qualifying marks prescribed is as under :

Category	Minimum Qualifying Marks in each section	Aggregate Marks
OC	30%	37%
SC/ST	20%	30%

Further, it is categorically mentioned in the notification that there shall be no further relaxation of marks or any other parameter under any circumstances owing to maintenance of efficiency of administration.

3. Accordingly, the LICE for JE (T) was conducted on 18.12.2022. As per SOP for conducting the online examination in BSNL, the provisional key in respect of aforesaid examination was published and queries with regard to question paper as well as answer key were invited from 20.12.2023 to 26.12.2023. Further, after scrutinizing and resolving the queries by Expert

Committee, on the basis of performances of all applicants in the said LICE, merit list was declared on 18.01.2023.

4. The merit list of said exam was declared on 18.01.2023. The applicant Shri L Mothilal (ST Category) secured 8.75 out of 50 marks for Part A and 13.75 marks out of 50 marks for Part B respectively and an aggregate of 22.25 marks out of 100 marks as tabulated below:

App.No.	HRMS	Name	Category	Qualifying marks for ST Category (20% of 50 Marks)	Marks of candidates in Part-A out of 50	Qualifying marks for ST Category (20% of 50 Marks)	Marks of candidates in Part-B out of 50	Qualifying marks for ST Category (30% of 100 Marks)	Total Score out of 100 marks
900522	199601629	L MOTHILAL	ST	10	8.75 (NQ)	10	13.75	30	22.5 (NQ)

5. Shri L Mothilal failed to secure minimum qualifying marks for Part I and in aggregate also. Minimum passing marks in ST Category for Part I was 10 out of 50, for Part II was 10 out of 50, and in aggregate it was 30 out of 100.

6. It is pertinent to mention here that as per the instructions contained in BSNL CO letter no. 25-1/2016-Rectt dated 21.02.2019, existing instructions to review process of result of failed SC/ST Candidates in BSNL LICE are as follows : -

*“In-principle, All the LICEs are unique and thus premise to review result of failed SC/ST candidates, in each LICE, differs. Therefore, after relaxation, if any, thereby to failed SC/ST candidates has to be decided/reviewed on each occasion (LICE). The process of review of failed SC & ST candidates in a particular LICE has to be initiated by Rectt Branch BSNL CO/ Circle, as the case may be, after the publication of result in accordance with the direction of Competent Authority by forming a committee as per usual practice. The committee shall take into account DoT letter no. 22-5/91-NCG dated 30.11.92, DoP&T’s Broucher on reservation for SC, ST & other backward classes in services circulated vide letter no. DPE-GM-15/0001/2016-GM-FTS-5921 dated 17.10.2016 and any other relevant orders related to review of result of failed SC/ST candidates in LICEs prevailing at that time.”*

7. As per the guidelines vide DoT letter no. 22-5/91-NCG, dated 30.11.92 which stated that “it has now been decided that result on only those failed Scheduled Caste candidates who have secured at least 20% marks and Scheduled Tribes candidates who have secured at least 15% marks in each paper.” It also states that “rest conditions of the letter no. 26/2/81-SPB I dated 04.05.81 will remain unchanged.” Some of the conditions mentioned in letter no. 26/2/81-SPB I dated 04.05.81 reiterated as

a. No special action is called where adequate numbers of SC/ST candidates qualify for the reserved posts.

b. The cases of failed candidates should be reviewed on the basis of confidential reports, the overall performance in examination etc. by a committee.

8. Further, as per DoP&T’s Broucher on reservation for SC, ST & other backward classes in services, the extent of relaxation should be decided on each occasion whenever such an examination is held, taking into account all relevant factor including : -

- a. The number of vacancies reserved.
- b. The performance of SC/ST candidates as well as General Candidates in the examination.
- c. The minimum standard of fitness for appointment to the post.
- d. The overall strength of the cadre and that of SC and ST in that cadre.

9. Accordingly, the statistical representation of SC/ST candidates for LICE JE(T) for Vacancy Year 2020 held on 18.12.2022 n has been prepared and tabulated as below –

**Statistical Representation of SC/ ST candidates for LICE JE (T) for VY 2020 held on 18.12.2022**

	<b>OC/UR</b>	<b>SC</b>	<b>ST</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>Vacancies for VY 2021</b> (for vacancies up to 31.12.2020)	307	65	40	412
<b>Appeared Candidates</b>	372	117	14	504
<b>Qualified Candidates</b>	215	92	10	317
<b>% of Qualified Candidates/Appeared Candidates</b>	<b>57.79</b>	<b>78.63</b>	<b>71.42</b>	

10. As per the declared result, 57.79% OC, 78.63% SC and 71.42% ST candidates qualified in the said LICE. The performance of ST candidates was fair enough and even better than OC Category candidates. As such in terms of category wise representation with respect to prescribed guidelines, it becomes evident that requisite number of category wise candidates qualified in the exam.

11. In the instant case of LICE for JE (T) in BSNL for vacancy year 2020, as pass percentage of SC and ST candidates is fair enough, there appears no reason to review the result of failed SC/ST candidates for further relaxation of qualifying standards.

12. Based upon the above facts, the request of Shri L Mothilal, Motor Driver cannot be considered w.r.t. your letter no. BSNLEU/519 (SC/ST) dated 16.10.02023.

This issues with the approval of the Competent Authority.



(Pravin Kumar Jha)  
Assistant General Manager (Rectt)

Copy to :

DGM(SCT), BSNL CO wrt U.O. No.65-01/2023-SCT dated 23.10.2023